AN EVALUATION REPORT FOR AN INCLUSION PROJECT RUN BY BIRMINGHAM MUSEUM SERVICE

KATE PONTIN BSc MA AMA
January 2001
“I’d like to be in a position to review the last 6 months, commenting on how well we’ve done despite the odd little glitch along the way”

Dan Pack when asked early on in the project where he would like to be in 6 months
CONTENTS

Key Points

Preface

1.0 Introduction
   What is Social Inclusion

2.0 Represent - a brief introduction
   Other recent social inclusion work in museums

3.0 Aims of the project
   Evaluation Strategy

4.0 Successes and failures of Represent
   Impact of Represent on the staff providers
   Impact of Represent on the museum

5.0 Impact on the young people attending Represent

6.0 Impact of Represent on museum networks
   Impact of Represent on the Region

7.0 Conclusions

Appendix
   Methodology
   Examples of types of data
   Evaluation of the evaluation
   Data forms and examples of texts collected
PREFACE

This report provides a summary of the evaluation programme at Birmingham. The project was funded by the Education Challenge Fund (DCMS) via the West Midlands Regional Museum Council.

The funding included the employment of a consultant to evaluate the project. Evaluation is often forgotten about, or is too subjective and summative. This particular programme made evaluation inherent in the programme from the start.

This evaluation provides a record of achievement and success for the users and providers of Represent. It also illustrates the methodology for this type of project and shows how effective it has been.

A clear methodology was established early on which relied on qualitative data collection from participants and providers. The findings do offer some pointers for those developing their own projects. The conclusions agree with a number of general recommendations made in other recent reports (see section two).

The report has been written in a brief and punchy style to make it easier to read. Quotes are given in separate sections for clarity. More details can be sought from the author.

The project is continuing and is hoping to receive more funding to continue into another year. Evaluation will continue to be an important element.

Thanks go to the West Midlands Regional Museums Council (WMRMC) for managing the project and to the challenge fund for providing the finance. The support of Emma Hawthorne (of WMRMC), and of Resource has been an important element in this work. Thanks also go to all the staff at Birmingham Museum and Art Gallery for their support, especially Dan Packe (Project Assistant), Simon Redgrave (Education Resource Officer) and Rachel Hunter Rowe (Development Officer). The young people involved in the programme are also to be praised for their enthusiasm and honest communications. Thanks in particular to: Nailah, Merika, Naomi, Masika, Sherita, and Odeana

© Birmingham City Museums, and West Midlands Regional Museum Council and Kate Pontin (51 Oakfield Road, Ashford, Middlesex, TW15 1DN

Confidentiality is kept throughout this report and all quotes from the young people therefore remain anonymous.

KEY POINTS
* The use of a “New Deal” employee not only provided employment for a young person, but also provided the appropriate networks and style for running a programme for young people. This was essential for the programme’s success. Dan Packe the person in post also developed his previous skills and knowledge. His skills and personality were critical in the development and success of the programme.

* The use of other facilitators where appropriate is a benefit to the programme. It was felt that Dr Paget’s sessions were critical to the success of the programme, initiating a spark.

* The initial reluctance of some of the other staff and management to become involved with the project was perhaps understandable but it did not help in the administration and development. Attitudes altered later on when staff could see how the project worked and how successful it had become. Now members of the museum are clearer about the work. Their future support will make further work easier. Training of staff may also be necessary to help develop an understanding of young people’s needs.

* There is a need to include the needs and wants of the users when designing for an outreach programme. A number of different ideas should be developed so that audience members can choose and develop ideas to suit their own needs. This develops a greater sense of ownership within the audience members.

* This sort of project is slow to start. It is often not clear what one is going to achieve or what one is going to do. However this develops as the project does. Initially there is a lot of contact building and numerous phone calls to actually find the right people to join the project. However initial aims should be worked out between staff, even if they are renegotiated later. Communication is important to maintain links within the team and also with the other museum staff.

* It should be remembered that the participants of an inclusive programme often value the social element more than anything else. It should start with something they feel interested in/comfortable with. Team building in an informal venue is important.

* Evaluation is critical if the museum, and the museum world in general, is going to learn anything for the future. Evaluation should be planned in from the beginning and be integral to the programme. Even if a consultant does the work there will still be a time element and commitment for all staff. It is important to disseminate the results and learning from the programme.

* It is essential to use networks to form partnerships. These are central to the success of the project and require the museum to negotiate roles for each partner and reconsider the aims in the light of partner needs.

* This sort of project should also inform museum policy and make such activity more central to the core aims of the museum.

1.0 INTRODUCTION
WHAT IS SOCIAL INCLUSION

Kate Pontin
Consultant Evaluator
1.1 Working with groups of non-traditional museum goers has become more widely accepted as an important aspect of work in the museum community. Project workers are now working with a wide range of audiences and are more focused in their aims. Much of this is a result of the government policy on social inclusion, with aims to include in society the whole range of groups of people who are currently excluded from many aspects of life. These include quality cultural experiences as well as work, health care, housing etc.

1.2 The term “social exclusion” embraces several factors; individuals and communities, direct and indirect influences, and geographical boundaries; urban, suburban and rural. Social deprivation has long been acknowledged as a problem in inner cities but it also occurs elsewhere. “It is what happens when people or areas suffer from a combination of linked problems such as unemployment, poor skills, low income, poor housing, high crime environments, bad health, poverty and family breakdown. The poor are excluded, but so are the old, the homeless the disenfranchised, the mentally ill and the culturally alienated.”

1.3 With government now placing importance of solving these problems funding is now available for museums and others to work on appropriate projects. Museums are natural engines for social inclusion work as long as we choose to adopt this role. It is clear from the reports described in section that many museums are choosing this role and developing a wide range of projects in response. Many local authorities have developed their own policy using DCMS definitions to develop their own focus. In Birmingham a new policy focusing on audience development is being written, which will help make this type of work more central to the long term museum function.

The DCMS suggest that social inclusion work should “promote the involvement in culture and leisure activities of those at risk of social disadvantage or marginalisation, particularly by virtue of the area they live in; their disability, poverty, age, racial or ethnic origin.” Museums will need to continue to develop appropriate programmes. Reading and learning about other museum projects will help develop a wide knowledge base to make future projects more successful.

---

1 Allsop, Julie; Rural Social Inclusion and Local Authority museums, in JEM 20, 1999, GEM
2 Forward by David Fleming in Museums and Social Inclusion, The GLLAM Report, 2000
3 Arts and Sport; Policy Action Team 10; A Report to the Social Exclusion Unit, DCMS 1999 as quoted in the GLLAM Report mentioned above, page 11.

Kate Pontin
Consultant Evaluator
REPRESENT
AN EVALUATION

2.0 INTRODUCTION TO REPRESENT

2.1 Introduction
Represent aimed to attract a new audience to the museum. However initially it planned to use the museum as a space for other activities that might appeal to this new audience.

2.12 Represent targeted young people from 15-25 and used a number of community museums as the basis for attracting young people from those local communities. The use of both Soho House and Aston Hall meant that young people were in fact attracted from more deprived areas, areas which are entitled to regeneration money. As a consequence the young people were disadvantaged in a number of ways, including lack of opportunities, unimproved urban areas, and race.

The young people who have been attracted to Represent so far are largely, but not exclusively from the black community. There are both men and women. Many are now at college studying for a range of qualifications, with one student hoping to go on and study law. Others are now employed, working in a variety of posts such as a dental nurse, shop assistant and care worker.

2.13 The project was organised by Simon Redgrave and colleagues at Birmingham Museum and Art Gallery (BM&AG), chiefly Rachel. A “New Deal” person was employed to assistant in the day to day running of the programme. Another young person, Lynette (?) with experience of working with young people was also employed for the first few months to help in the development of the project. Sarah Riddle, a student on a post graduate museum studies course placement also contributed to the early phases of the project. All the young people made positive contributions to the project, providing ideas and a social context for the young people to join.

2.14 Dan Packe, the New Deal person used previous contacts with agencies and community groups involved with young people, and a number of new ones to contact as many young people as possible. This took a lot of time and hard work.

2.15 Initially sessions were given by Dr Paget a psychologist who has worked with numerous groups of young people. His sessions focused on developing personal confidence and setting achievable goals for life. The young people enjoyed the sessions and more attended later sessions as word got around.

Quotes from people involved ....

I really believe in the project … I am totally committed to it.  Sarah Riddle

Success is not determined due to numbers .. it is dependent on the links we make or enhance with the local community Dan Packe

It is important to make the group feel important because that way you’re guaranteed a good response  Dan Pack

It was a different way of approaching them, something unique  Dan referring to Represent

Used major amount of coercion and persuasion to get people to attend  Dan

Disappointed at the numbers attending the first session, Dan Packe (However Simon felt that they indicated that the programme would develop into a successful as time went by.

The “Paget” sessions were inspiring and critical to getting it off the ground referring to the project in general. J Arthur

It appears that our sessions with Dr Paget have been quite a hit” Dan

Today was a good day - up to 23 now who’ve shown an interest  Dan

---

4 New Deal is a government scheme to provide opportunities for work and training for those out of work for more than 6 months. It has a number of conditions and much administration.

Kate Pontin
Consultant Evaluator
2.16 Early in the project the young people were taken to the Bristol Carnival to help develop a team spirit within the group. Subsequent trips took place to museums such as Liverpool Maritime Museum, Victoria and Albert Museum and the Tate Modern. These aimed to provide the attendees with a wider experience of museums. Topics of study included slavery and looking at art. Art sessions included work in Birmingham where students describing paintings for others wearing blindfolds, developing many oral and thinking skills. They also had a number of other social outings such as meals out and an evening at Aston Hall, by candlelight. This developed the social and team element.

2.17 After the initial trips the young people then attended scrapbook sessions. These started with a training workshop with ideas on how to design interesting layouts. Photographs had been taken at a variety of venues (Museums and Carnival). Labels were written and page layouts designed. These sessions continued for longer than had been planned and were very successful. It was an opportunity to personalise the programme for each individual.

2.18 In contrast the object sessions did not go very well, largely because of the scheduling in the daytime, when many of the group members were now at college. Trying evening slots would have been useful.

Other activities also failed to come to fruition for one reason or another. These included a barbecue at Soho House which had various problems in the organisation stage with poor communication between members of staff. Now that the project has developed and been successful it is possible that communication skills have improved. A successful track record will also make future work easier to develop.

2.19 Further funding is now being sought for another year. Before then there are a number of other events planned. These include learning about graffiti art, visits to other museums (Bradford) and developing resources for the museum.

2.2 SOCIAL INCLUSION PREVIOUS WORK

Kate Pontin
Consultant Evaluator
In the past there has, in museum education departments, been projects with a whole range of audience groups but this work was not considered in the context of social inclusion and the provision of long term service for all these groups.

In Leicester Museum Service we worked with a number of groups including the rurally deprived, people with special needs, and schools in areas lived in by ethnic minorities. We were working towards attracting the full range of audiences to the museum but often with out a proper policy.

However Government and social trends have helped museums focus more clearly on these types of service and provided an opportunity to prioritise. We now have clearer aims of what we want to achieve in terms of audiences development.

A number of reports have recently provided case studies and guidelines for such work.

2.21 Museums and Young People, 1997
This report provides information on a number of recent and innovative projects with young people run by museums. Some of the case studies described below illustrate the range of projects that have been tried.

2.22 Cartwright Hall, Bradford
This museum already has higher levels of young people from diverse background visiting. The Museum is responsive to community interests and states audience developments at the core of its mission.

Display themes are developed for a range of different audiences, for example the recent exhibition “Sound and Fury Heavy Metal Art”. The museum helped interpret the topic for the alienated person as well as the keen enthusiast.

As a result of such programmes it has been successful in attracting young people and new audiences.

2.23 Focus groups
The Liverpool Tate developed a consultative group of young people in 1994 (14 - 25 year olds). Those belonging to the group had had previous contact with the museum. They attended monthly meetings, providing advice on how to make the Tate more accessible to the young.

The young people also helped plan and run events for the young. There were also a number of drop in sessions to support the less committed visitor coming. Much of the funding for these projects is spent on the young people’s travel expenses.

Oldham Art Gallery also used focus groups are used to find out what young people want. Results have highlighted their interests, how they use their leisure time, what would attract them to the gallery, and their reactions to art displayed.

The results from consultation show that the young people do feel welcome in the museum but would like more appropriate facilities. These have included:

Kate Pontin
Consultant Evaluator
cheap vegetarian food, access for the disabled, music, less labels, more from the artists themselves, opportunities to meet artists and museum staff audio guides made by other young people.

2.24 Developing exhibitions
Newcastle “Discovery”, Tate Liverpool and the “People’s Story” in Edinburgh used young people to curate exhibitions including selecting items and writing texts. Exhibitions have included topics on textiles and costume, and multi-cultural topics such as the Scottish/Chinese women’s textile project. These projects show the quality of young people’s work and their developing confidence.

2.25 Concluding Comments
Guidelines offer help in running these types of programmes, and include the need to plan, prepare, and evaluate. These points are also highlighted throughout this report on Represent.

2.3 The recent JEM 20 (Journal of the Group for Education in Museums) also provides a number of case studies in inclusion projects, written by the practitioners themselves. It includes a look at the mobile museum run in Herefordshire, Worcestershire and Shropshire. This museum initiative uses a bus to take the displays to the public. Many people living in rural communities are deprived of local facilities and in particular transport. The museum bus has visited supermarkets, youth clubs, schools and hospitals amongst others. There are plans to develop the work further to visit a wider range of venues.

2.31 Other projects written up in JEM 20 include the work with the Cowgate Women’s Group, at the People’s Gallery in Newcastle. Here women from a disadvantaged area with high levels of unemployment, were given opportunities to develop an exhibition of photographs recording their own community life. Many of the sessions were at the museum, with transport and crèche facilities provided. The project continues and develops as the women feel more able and confident to tackle new activities.

2.32 “Opening Doors” is a project run by Artswork, a youth arts development agency, which aims to encourage young people into museums. A number of different projects are being piloted throughout the country. Young people worked with an artist at the Redditch museum, the Forge Mill Needle Museum. The work resulted in an exhibition. The education officer actively supported the programme. The project worker, Suzanne makes a number of recommendations which highlight a number of areas that the Represent Project also found important. See in the box opposite for a summary of her findings. There were other arts projects with young people in the north east. This illustrates the trend to attract this age group. Resource staff felt strongly that they wished to concentrate on museum processes and objects

---

5 Suzanne Rider; “Opening the Doors” in JEM 20, Group for Education in Museums, page 10

Kate Pontin
Consultant Evaluator
rather than doing art work. The theme was used to link the activities the young people did?

2.3 In the recent GLLAM (Group for Large Local Authority Museums) report on Inclusion, many case studies are used to illustrate the range of inclusive projects that have been done in Local Authority Museums such as those by Tyne and Wear, and Nottingham, Birmingham and Southampton museum services. The projects are described within the context of the parameters set by Government paper on Social Inclusion and how museums should be working on it. The DCMS (Department of Culture, Media and Sport) has a number of aims with respect to museums and other organisations tackling social exclusion. They are:

* To promote achievement in schools and life long learning
* To provide caring services for vulnerable groups
* To tackle crime and the fear of crime
* To implement the anti-poverty strategy
* To tackle the issue of fuel poverty
* To develop employment and training initiative
* To implement the “Healthy Dundee” strategy (using multi-agency approaches)

2.31 The report itself concentrates on how the projects have impacted on various aspects which are:
- personal growth and development,
- community empowerment,
- the representation of inclusive communities,
- promoting healthier communities
- enhancing educational achievement
- promoting lifelong learning
- tackling unemployment and crime

2.32 Each of these issues is discussed with reference to a number of different cases studies. The Birmingham project with asian women illustrates well the type of project being used to promote a healthier community. *The project targeted Asian women who lived in isolation due to mental health problems* and involved using Aston Hall as a stimulus to make new textiles, especially embroidery. These have been displayed along with other people’s work at the Victoria and Albert Museum. The project as subsequently developed according to the needs and interests of the women. *Like the best socially inclusive work, it services a local purpose, has achieved considerable independence and needs less and less input from the museum, which can then be looking for other initiatives.* A second group has now started at Soho House.

---

Kate Pontin
Consultant Evaluator

[^6]: Museums and Social Inclusion, GLLAM, page 12
[^7]: Museums and Social Inclusion, GLLAM, page 35
[^8]: Museums and Social Inclusion, GLLAM, page 35
2.33 Represent, the subject of this report is also briefly mentioned in the section on tackling unemployment, as are a whole range of other projects relating to different aspects. These include working with people living in high rise flats in Sheffield, family literacy in Plymouth and working with visually impaired people in Wolverhampton.

2.34 The authors (Leicester Research Centre) suggest that good practice is underpinned by having a good policy framework within local and national government. This new policy has meant museums have questioned their work and refocused their resources into more appropriate practice. Museums themselves require good leadership, with leaders being appropriately trained and in committed to *promote inclusion and inspire and motivate* their staff. It is also important that to tackle new areas of work one needs to take risks and try new approaches and ideas. The report also highlights the needs to be responsive and flexible in such project work. Community consultation and involvement, and formation of partnerships, is necessary to empower these new user groups.

2.35 Evaluation is highlighted in the report as being essential in any programme. *Evaluation should be in keeping with the culture of the community* with the participants being given opportunities to develop skills they will require in the assessment process. Only with effective evaluation can museums learn from each other and make increasingly effective programmes. Lastly, advocacy is necessary for museums to actually hear about these projects that are occurring and the lessons that can be learnt from them.

2.36 The report also highlights the high levels of commitment from the museums themselves and the increased self-esteem within the museum community as a result of successful projects. These aspects illustrate that museums are changing too and that this type of work is permeating into the core policies that museums are working towards.

The concluding guidelines again highlight some of the recommendations in this report, for example the need to inform all staff, have a clear vision and aims, consultation with all parties and use of facilitators wherever necessary.

---

9 ibid, page 45
10 ibid, page 47

Kate Pontin
Consultant Evaluator
Concluding Guidelines

* There is a need for good planning and preparation,
* There needs to be clear aims and brief,
* Staff need to be appropriately trained,
* There needs to be a recognition of how different groups of people work and how to work with them,
* Networking (with clear aims) is critical to the project’s success,
* It is important to follow up and evaluate properly,
* The project needs to be marketed appropriately,
* Using facilitators wherever possible is helpful,
* Consultation with users is also paramount, and programmes altered accordingly. Projects should be responsive although there should be a clear strategy,

* Long Term projects are ultimately what we should be aiming for, with a balance of education, programming, marketing, and publicity. Shorter projects often evolve into longer ones if funding is available,

* All staff need to be informed and there needs to be a clear vision.
3.0 EVALUATION STRATEGY
It is important when setting up an evaluation to use the project aims to set up evaluation aims. It will then be clear whether these aims have actually been achieved. Thus I shall briefly list programmes and then evaluation aims.

The aims of Represent as described in the initial brief were as follows:

3.1.1 to gain a better understanding of the needs, wishes, starting points and goals of disadvantaged young people,

3.1.2 to test out an innovative approach to the development of a new audience in the museum,

3.1.3 to engage young people in the work of BM&AG to improve their confidence and communication skills,

3.1.4 to provide young people and families with quality learning opportunities to improve basic skills,

3.1.5 to enable BM&AG to be more accessible and responsive to Birmingham’s diverse communities,

3.1.6 to establish relationships with other agencies committed to improving basic skills and communication with young people,

3.1.7 to provide a model of good practice, for other museums, to adapt to their own needs,

3.1.8 to enable WMRMC to evaluate the process of staff, from different museums in the region, working together as a means of developing staff skills.

These ideas remained clear in the minds of the providers throughout the project. However certain aspects had different priority at different stages of the project.

3.2 THE EVALUATION BRIEF AIMS

Sarah Riddle quoted in her diaries the following aims:

young people gain confidence to achieve through the use of heritage, motivate them

and

to teach basic skills - writing, IT etc, training them as ambassadors for the museum,

and for the museum

to help change perceptions of museums and make them accessible

Sarah suggests a sense of identity is the central theme with the identity of the museum and of the young people being discussed.
As part of the original brief a clear set of aims were established for the evaluation itself. These aims clearly need to relate to the project aims, but offer a refined focus in which to set up the evaluation. The aims for the evaluation were as follows:

3.2.1 To assess how successful the museum has been at achieving the aims above in 3.1.

3.2.2 To find out what impact this type of project has on:
* motivation, skills and confidence of young people,
* attitude to learning of the young people,
* working practices for the museum,
* the attitude of the project partners to the museum.

3.2.3 To find what aspects resulted in being the key elements of the project.

3.31 PRIORITISATION
These aims were further defined at an early meeting of the evaluator and the providers. Priorities were established so that best use could be made of time. As a result it was clear that the main aim was to provide information on how successful the project was in trying to attract new audiences to museums. Thus this evaluation pays particular attention to the sorts of factors that contributed to the success in attracting a new audience to the museum. These prioritised aims are shown in the box opposite.

3.32 The evaluation depends on showing the changes in the attitudes and feelings, and the behaviour of the young people. For this aspect it is clear that their own evaluation of the project is important. Thus a range of data has been collected through out the project from the users as well as the providers.

3.33 Using the “New Deal” person to collect some of the data from the attendees was helpful as the young people had a closer relationship with him than with myself, and thus may have felt more at ease talking to him (after all I am white and middle-aged). However I also spoke to them without any member of the museum staff being present providing a different type of opportunity to comment on the project if they wished.
3.4 DEVELOPMENT OF EVALUATION STRATEGY

3.4.1 The project team decided to use an external evaluator for this study. The advantages of doing this were to provide an outside view of the project. An independent evaluator “sees more”, and is less subjective as there is no sense of ownership of the project. A dedicated evaluator will also have appropriate specialist skills, and dedicated time to do the work. He/she can observe the providers as well as the other stakeholders, and the users. There may also be more authority in a report written by an outside worker rather than one of the museum staff.

3.4.2 The major disadvantage of using an outside evaluator is that he/she has to take time to build up relationships and trust within the project group. This can take a long time if members are unsure of the benefits of evaluating the project and can feel it is a judgement on themselves, rather than the whole project.

3.5 On the appointment of an evaluator and the establishment of the priority aims a methodology and appropriate evaluation tools were developed. Details of the methods used can be seen in the appendix. Data was collected through out the project and time was spent with both providers and attendees getting to know individuals and gathering their opinions. As data was collected, analysis was started and resulting ideas recorded. Finally this report was written to inform others of what was discovered.

4.0 PROVIDERS FEELINGS ABOUT THE OVERALL SUCCESS OF THE PROJECT

Kate Pontin
Consultant Evaluator
As central figures in overseeing the project, both Simon and Rachel were deeply involved in Represent and thus can make a fair judgement on the successes and failures. They have gained a feel for what has worked well compared with their original aims.

4.11 Both Rachel Hunter Rowe and Simon Redgrave felt the chief successes were:

* Succeeding in providing an outreach programme for young people. This had not been done at Birmingham Musuem and Art Gallery before.

* **Employing a “New Deal” person**, and in particular someone as good as Dan Packe was a great success and showed the impact employing a young person can have on the changing culture of the museum and on the outreach project itself.

* Providing an opportunity for Dan to develop skills and confidence during the project was also seen as a positive outcome. Dan’s confidence and ability to run the programme has continued to develop.

* **Learning more about the young peoples needs** directly from the young people themselves will provide the information needed to develop appropriate services within the museum in the future.

* Using the success of this outreach project to ask for further opportunities to develop new audiences and to continue the work with young people.

* Making this type of outreach central to the museum work is now a real possibility as new policy will affect the ethos of the whole museum. There is currently development of a **new access policy** and possible positive action traineeships.

* The accompanying advertising, that is the represent leaflet and the new web site will reach new audiences and offer a more appropriate image of the Museum. A high profile for the project and the Museum within the council may also increase funds for such outreach work.

* Possible new opening hours for the museum will help provide opportunities for new visitors to have time to visit. Evening opening is particularly important.

* A good mix of skills and personalities within the team has helped develop new skills within all members of the team.

4.12 Simon thought that **using outside skills** such as Dr Paget and myself as evaluator was important, when they were not available within the museum. The sessions lead by Dr Paget were instrumental in enthusing the young people and motivating them to continue with the programme. Simon felt the quality of the initial part of the project was very important.

Kate Pontin
Consultant Evaluator
4.13 The project developed further from Simon’s original ideas and took on a life of its own. We started with two people who did not want to go into Aston Hall and now there are many young people committed (Simon Redgrave).

4.2 PROBLEMS
Simon and Rachel felt there were few real problems but highlighted a few minor issues:

* The slow change of the corporate structure to make such activity central
* It was too successful a programme with too many people coming, making individual support more difficult.
* Simon found it difficult to let project develop and grow without interfering (it had been his original idea and he found it difficult to let go).
4.3 IMPACT ON PROVIDERS and MUSEUM STAFF
The following comments summarise some of the aspects which have impacted on the staff of the museum, especially the providers. Many of these aspects relate to how their working practices have been affected.

4.31 Impact on staff of outreach work
Evidence from the providers shows that support from the Museum grew as the programme progressed and became successful. Knowledge of the programme however was patchy (Jane Arthur) depending on whether staff worked at one of the sites involved.

4.32 Funding
Initial administration was often convoluted and full of red tape. The “New Deal” system could certainly be improved. The impact on Dan’s and other administrative staff was huge as much time was spent trying to sort it out.

4.33 Aims of the project needed to be discussed and agreed with amongst the museum team. The focus develops as the programme developed and discussion took place, challenging currently held ideas. The final project is a compromise between the museum and the partners. Keeping in contact and maintaining relationships is also important. This resulted in staff becoming more flexible about the project and adapting to suit others’ ideas and needs.

4.34 Planning
Planning requires much longer than one would think. The types of possible sessions and the resources required need planning and organising. Early ideas included Brumillenium, Black History Month, using the young people’s objects in an exhibition and a barbecue. Not all the ideas were used, but it gave the young people an opportunity to choose and adapt to their own interests. There does however need to be a thread to link the events together.

4.35 Time for Networking
Notes show that development of the programme (including networking) took much more time to do than might be imagined. The development of contacts with other youth services and thus to interest young people took time, determination. Many phone calls fail to provide any results whatsoever. However the networking is critical.

4.36 Museum staff (all) need fuller understanding and respect for young workers and users. Attitudes need to change so that they do not feel inferior or out of place. Other Officers also judged too quickly as to what the youths might or might not do.

Kate Pontin
Consultant Evaluator
4.37 Personal Benefits
Personal benefits ranged from working with colleagues one does not normally work with, learning about young people and their needs, developing one's skills and enjoying the programme.

Sarah Riddle also felt she had benefited from her attachment to the museum as part of her museum studies course at Newcastle. She felt she had also contributed to the running of Represent too, offering support at the critical planning stage.

I enjoyed the Roy Paget session .... there was a buzz around them
Simon

Increased professional identity
Rachel

reaffirmed position on how the world works
Simon with regard to his beliefs in museums being for people

It was a useful experience working alongside professionals
Sarah

I was enthused and inspired, .... it was rewarding to see all the planning come to fruition
Sarah
4.4 IMPACT ON STAFF
CASE STUDY
DAN PACKE
Dan felt he had gained:

* a job (as previously unemployed)

* development of skills already had from previous work with young people
  * I know he had the right skills and attitudes to make the project a success (Sarah)

* Change of perceptions about museums - he had had little experience of them previously.
  * Most people that go to them are white, middle class and so on and unfortunately I’m neither so why would I have though about going to a museum (Dan)

* Proved he could do the job and put ideas into practice

* Can now articulate better how feel about museums and art

* Gained a lot from other workers such as Sarah about museums and work within them *Sarah was a vital team member* (Dan)

Dan however did have a number of concerns throughout the project which are important for future work:

* There were huge problems with sorting out the New Deal scheme and being paid etc. It took enormous amounts of time and energy to sort it all out. There is a need to feed back some of this to government.

  * Hacked off with long term problems with New Deal
  * there are days when I wonder if it would be easier to quit (Dan)

* Limited budget

* Problems with staff within City Council, Birmingham Museum and elsewhere (notably the V&A) where staff either had problems relating to Dan or to the young people using the museum space. There is much training needed to change attitudes and customer care strategies with all museum staff.

4.5 IMPACT ON THE MUSEUM
This section looks at the immediate impact on the museum and the implications for the longer term with outreach work for the young and other audiences.
**4.51 Immediate impact on the Museum**

Larger numbers than originally expected and planned for attended the programme. This made it more difficult for the providers although it shows the enormous success of the programme. There was less time to provide individual support. However it does show the enthusiasm of the young people for such a diverse programme which supports an focuses on them rather than the museum. It takes a long time to develop a more museum focus.

**4.52 Early on in the project some felt that the project did not sit easily within prevailing culture at the Museum. It felt like an add on rather than central to museum policy. This made it difficult to encourage young people in the project while not being entirely convinced that the museum would support and take on board any conclusions.**

It also felt difficult to encourage the young people when the programme was not fully thought out. This lack of clarity sometimes made it difficult to remain motivated. Much of these feelings left as the project continued and the focus became more clear and refined. the museum also became more interested in the work and began to take on board some of the issues highlighted by the project.

**4.6 Continuing the Project**

The success of the project suggests that it should continue. Simon Redgrave is already looking for further funds

**4.61 Further services for young people need to be developed as part of Represent and other projects. These may include displays of their own work, further courses and workshops, object handling sessions at more appropriate times (evening sessions) , developing their own museum resources and opportunities for further visits to other museums .**

**4.62 There is a need to react to comments made by the young people with regard to changes that could be made to the museum. These responses should be fast and effectively where possible. A new advisory group could be set up to consult with this group about changes in the museum. This group could also provide alternative labels for exhibitions. A space for young people in the museum might be a way of making them feel more welcome.**
4.63 Customer care training is needed for staff in particular on working with young people.

4.7 Other Audiences
There is a need to consider new projects with other minority groups.

4.71 There is a need to alter job descriptions of members of staff to make outreach work less marginal and more central to peoples work

4.72 Non visitor survey and focus groups for particular non users would be useful.

4.73 The new Access Policy will help provide a context for this new work to develop. New networks will be required and new partners for new user groups. Promotion of new services will be central for attracting new audiences.

4.74 The project should also impinge on management. Talking to a member of management it was clear that the project had had a major impact on the management team. Represent has been one of the driving forces behind the new social inclusive strategy which is now in draft form. Jane Arthur is clear Represent has influenced this process.

She feels the strategy will impact on the museum and make inclusion work more central to the work done. In the future there is hoped to be a continuation and development of the Represent project. Funding is now being sought for some audience development work, “bringing other audiences to the museum”.

Management has also trying to initiate a number of new posts, traineeships for people from minorities.

Kate Pontin
Consultant Evaluator
5.0 IMPACT AND BENEFITS ON YOUNG PEOPLE

The following session illustrates the range of benefits that the young people felt they had had. Their commitment to the project was exciting. Their advice on how to improve the programme and the Museum is also given.

Both those attending the programme, and the providers agreed that there has been a lot of positive outcomes. Although not all of the original plans have been followed as the programme has developed to fulfill both groups’ needs. Staff have learnt more about the needs and interests of the young.

5.1 1 Enjoyment

Firstly all those I spoke to said how much they had enjoyed themselves. This is most important, as without this, not much else is possible.

5.12 Reasons for attending

Most of those attending joined because it was the summer holidays and they had nothing else to do. They did not know it was about museum to start with and came because they liked the idea of a free trip to Bristol Carnival. They were, in return asked to attend at least 2 of the following sessions. These sessions were interesting enough for many of the young people to continue to attend the other events programmed through out the Autumn.

Some of the young people had visited museums previously, but many had not, having only been on school trips which they found boring and unmemorable.

5.13 Introductory sessions and their impact

The sessions by Dr Paget appear unrelated to the museum but they relate to the skills needed for using museum spaces - the need for a broadened knowledge, thinking skills, an open mind and the confidence to express an opinion.

**These sessions helped the young people focus on what they wanted** to achieve and made them believe they could achieve them. The young people felt the sessions were entertaining and inspiring. They felt more confident as a result. In fact one young person felt it had helped her at college as she felt more confident in herself.
5.14 Social Element
The young people also found the programme had an important social element. **They enjoyed meeting new people and making new friends.** They also felt it had been beneficial working as a team.

5.15 Using Museums
Those attending the focus sessions said that they enjoyed the museum trips. This was also obvious from watching them all too. They found the Victoria and Albert stimulating and the objects (costume, armour, weapons and gold and jewellery) stunning. The young people also spent time interpreting, discussing and understanding what they saw. A group of young women spent much time deconstructing a religious piece of art work. Their knowledge and interpretation was highly skilled and committed. It was impressive. They commented that they would like to return as they felt frustrated that they had not seen everything.

Comments about museums from those attending Represent were generally positive. They felt that museums could only go so far to attract new users as people needed to want to go to them, and thus there is a need to alter people’s perception about museums in general. Once they had visited some museums on the programme though they felt more able to use them.

Since the programme started a number have visited museums independently and some had taken family members. This was partly due to an increased knowledge of what was inside the museum. They also felt more confident to. However they would like more information on what is inside a museum before they visit as one is not always interested in what is there.

When visiting museums thought they also now more able to comment on what they see. They are able to say whether they like something or not and why. They commented that a guide (audio or human) would be helpful.

They are enthusiastic about the next trips. Despite various problems at the Victoria and Albert Museum with security staff following them, they felt that they were welcomed in the museums.
5.16 Ownership
The young people felt that their input had been taken on board and that they felt a certain amount of ownership. Further exhibition of their art work (graffiti) will extend this too. They agreed the need to have extended opening hours so they could visit in evenings and perhaps have a space for themselves.

5.17 Bringing the family
The original aims also stated that the programme should inspire the young people to bring family which they have done, and to visit independently. One young women took her sister to Birmingham Musum and Art Gallery for a day out, both enjoyed themselves.

5.18 Skills development
Represent also aimed to develop basic skills. Although this area was not as fully developed as initially intended in the programme, improvements in skills were seen. These included writing labels, expressing themselves, and developing personal elements in Dr Paget’s sessions. These have lead the young people to think more about what they want, reflect on what they have done, be more creative, and broaden their horizons.

Several of the young women said they had learnt about their own culture and that of others. They particularly enjoyed looking at the slave galleries at Liverpool Maritime Museum and would have liked to know more. They also found the paintings more interesting than they originally thought, and learnt how to deconstruct and discuss their content. Many of the paintings were disliked but they learnt to express their opinions. Initially they thought that they were supposed to like everything.

5.2 Negative aspects
Although the young people I spoke to were very positive about Represent and the Museum they did have a number of ideas which they felt would make improvements.

5.21 The major comment about Represent was that now they were all at College they had less time to commit to the programme. They still wished to attend but whatever time and day was chosen would be inappropriate for someone.

5.22 They wanted more activities out of Birmingham to experience new places. Subsequent to these discussions were planned trips to London and Bradford

Kate Pontin
Consultant Evaluator
5.23 Some young people also commented on the embarrassing nature of some of the behavior of other members of the group.

5.3 **Summary of Young People’s Needs**

* Need to feel welcome
* To know what is in each museum before they go in
* A social element to museum visiting
* Topics of interest to young people like themselves such as fashion, jewellery, slavery etc
* Appropriate opening times

6.0 **IMPACT ON NETWORKING**

6.11 Although the museum workers already had a number of networks and contacts in the local communities these were widened and deepened by the Represent project. New links have also been made with a wide range of organisations such as... Longer term relationships which offer opportunities to both parties are essential to inclusive work

6.12 The potential for new projects in the future is huge. These will be more easily established and set up following this experience.

6.13 In the Access Policy, currently being developed it is important that these relationships need maintaining and developed by museum staff. The relationship needs to offer partnerships which satisfies both parties’ requirements. Joint grant applications may also be possible. There are, I am sure a number of bodies who have been particularly keen to be involved with the museum. It would be useful to continue to use other sites belonging to appropriate organisations such as the Newtown Community Centre, and thus develop a new image for the museum.

6.14 Museum organisations will now be able to understand what museums can offer.
6.2 IMPACT ON THE REGION and the MUSEUMS COUNCIL

6.21 Dissemination to the region and the country
Dissemination of the project has been via the region’s newsletter, Mercury, and through a number of seminars. These have attracted audiences from a wide range of museums in the area. A number of directors have also requested information on the project.

The high profile within the region has been widened to a more national coverage in journals and conferences. This has benefited the museum and the region as a whole by promoting new approaches to museum work. The region has much to offer other areas and Represent has much to teach others.

6.22 Ideas used to inform other projects and staff of Council
Emma Hawthorne the officer involved in the project for the Regional Council has provided information and support to a number of different museums and programmes. Thus ideas and information on Represent has informed other work. This included the work previously mentioned in section 2 at the Forge Needle Museum, in Redditch. **Dissemination of inclusion work is essential to support other museums**

6.23 Support for Represent from Emma and the Council
Emma has also been there to advice and to support the team. Emma felt the project was an ambitious one and her one worry was how she could help if it started to fail. However she feels it has been a success.

6.24 Used as a case study by the Museum Council to attract more funds
The Regional Museum Council is pleased with the success of the project, especially with the increasing number of youths attending and in their continuing involvement.

---

Kate Pontin
Consultant Evaluator
REPRESENT
AN EVALUATION

The project has been useful to promote museum education and to try to gain more money from grants etc for further work.

6.25 A high profile for Birmingham Museum and Art Gallery
Using Represent as a case study through out the region has meant a high profile for the project and for the museum itself.

7.0 CONCLUSIONS
In the conclusions I want to summarise what was learnt from the project and refer back to the original aims to reflect on how successful it was in achieving these.

7.1 Impact on the young people
7.11 motivation and confidence
As was illustrated in section five, the young people have benefited from the programme. They now feel more confident and motivated to succeed in their ambitions. They also appear more motivated to visit museums. The programme has developed a greater understanding of museums and what they can offer young people. It has also provided opportunities for the young people to provide comment on what they would like to see museums doing for them. This has increased in the sense of ownership.

7.12 Skills
Basic skills programmes were not eventually developed as part of this programme. However the young people did develop a number of skills including basic writing skills, taking photographs and other intellectual developments such as expressing their own opinions, justifying feelings, working as a team. Several young people also mentioned that they had developed a greater understanding of paintings and art, and of topics of particular interest to them, such slavery. This point illustrates the need to consider appropriate cultural contexts and interests.

7.13 Attitude to learning
There is little evidence to show a major change in their attitude to learning as this is difficult to detect. Many have gone on to college anyway and thus had a fairly positive attitude anyway. However they are now more confident and focused about their learning and realise that informal learning centres such as museums are not always boring.

7.14 Enthusiasm for museums
As said above this has improved with many stating that their attitudes towards museums were very negative to start with. Some may well still feel alienated but others now feel able to visit on their own or with families, in fact they have done so

11 after all those less enthusiastic about the programme were probably not at the focus group session

Kate Pontin
Consultant Evaluator
indicating a greater enthusiasm but also increased confidence. They commented that they needed to know what was inside to know if it would be of interest to them. This is something that museums need to tackle.

7.2 Impact on museum
The aspects which have made this project successful have been highlighted throughout the report and are summarised at the beginning. They relate to a wide range of factors. Although these factors relate to this particular project, they do highlight the areas that all inclusive projects, particularly those with young people need to consider. As can be seen they link clearly to the comments made in several of the reports discussed in section two (please see box of key points and links below).

These factors include making such outreach and inclusive work more integral in museum policy and output. This long term success is a significant step for the Museum.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>REPRESENT</th>
<th>OTHER REPORTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>New Deal person employed</td>
<td>right personalities, use of facilitors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>use of facilitators such as Dr Paget and Kpontin</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increased enthusiasm from management and staff as project proves itself</td>
<td>set up structure for consultation to take place as paramount</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>consultation and ownership by those attending</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Networks are essential and needs of partners need to be taken into account</td>
<td>Networks are critical Need to know how other organisations work and how work with them</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planning is critical as are clear aims communication with staff involved and those not involved</td>
<td>clear about what want to achieve review and alter inform staff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social element is important</td>
<td>warm-up sessions break the ice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluation and dissemination important use of marketing important</td>
<td>Need to evaluate and disseminate market properly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work needs to be central to museum policy</td>
<td>Staff need appropriate training Have long term aims</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Kate Pontin
Consultant Evaluator
REPRESENT
AN EVALUATION

7.21 Problems/issues encountered
criticism of the early stages may be unfair as this project is such a new step for the museum and staff were lacking experience in this type of project. However it is worthwhile noting the following problems.

* The need for more communication between different staff (often on different sites) so that all members know how work is progressing, and so that they are able to add their own ideas. This is particularly so in the early planning stages. Sarah Riddle found she was often filling the co-ordinator role as she visited the different sites to find out more about the project and museum service. Organisation of the project is hard at the beginning and takes much ordered planning and direction. Support is needed for the chief project workers in this early stage to iron out problems and continue building networks.

* There needs to be a clear set of aims. These are often difficult to write in a focused way but this develops as planning goes on. Discussion and brainstorming of what different project workers wants to achieve helps develop an agreed focus. This is so important to the ultimate success of the project. In Represent different members of staff had different ideas and staff were not always given the opportunity to discuss and agree on them. Eventually a clearer and agreed set of priorities developed.

* There needs to be a range of different activities planned so that the project members can chose which they feel is most interesting and appropriate for them. A number of events did not eventually happen. This may have been seen as a failure but it is probably a normal occurrence.

7.3 Impact on museums working practices

It appears that the museum is beginning to embrace social inclusions work and an audience focus in general. A new Access Policy is now being developed, with the possibility of new trainee posts for ethnic minorities. Jane Arthur, of management says that it is important to *embed it into the culture to sustain it*.

7.24 Are museums good places for doing this sort of work

The overwhelming success of this project illustrates just how good museums are at providing opportunities for a wide range of audiences including young people. However it is important to approach the work with a focus on the users needs (and not those of the museum and staff) and use partners to help support this focus. As the project progresses and the users become more familiar with the museum they will be more able to consider developing skills to understand museums. As museums do more outreach and inclusive work and talk to new users more they will alter and adapt to

Kate Pontin
Consultant Evaluator
suit a wider range of audiences. This evolution is illustrated in the GLLAM report where the museum undergoes a cyclic and never ending change as new activities are developed to support the use of museums by wider ranging audiences\textsuperscript{12}.

7.25 \textbf{Attitude of the project partners to the museum}
As discussed earlier the regional museum council considered Represent a success. It was also considered a success in terms of benefits for the museum council. Other partners are happy to continue links with the project and develop their relationship with the museum.

\textsuperscript{12} Museums and Social Inclusion, GLLAM report, page 54

Kate Pontin
Consultant Evaluator
APPENDIX 1
EVALUATION TECHNIQUES USED

Data Sources used throughout the project:

* Video film of events taken by Dan Packe
* Diaries from various providers especially Dan and Sarah Riddle
* Conversation with providers and attendees as well as management (eg interviews and focus groups)
* Notes from my observations of different events and meetings
* Comments on activity sheets (art session) done by attendees part way through the programme
* Evaluations from attendees part way through programme
* Resulting resources such as scrapbooks.

Some of the above data was gathered by Dan as discussed in the evaluation section (section 3)

As always all data is confidential and kept by the evaluator. Thus names of individual attendees have not been used in this report where quotes have been used.

Analysis used sorting of data according to the original aims, and looking for the positive and negative evidence.

For examples of forms and samples of data please see copies at the end of the appendix.
DIARIES - INFORMATION TO INCLUDE

Museum workers need to comment on

Their feelings about the project
the success for events etc (the quality of them)
feelings about how participants are doing/their motivation and development
Understanding of needs/wishes/starting points and goals
Responsiveness
Relationship with agencies
Impact on themselves and of museum

Evaluation forms from users

Feelings about museums now and in the past
How they are enjoying the programme
EVALUATION OF EVALUATION

The following notes point to various aspects of the evaluation process which the evaluator feels were very good and also aspects which in some way needed improving. This does not mean that the evaluation is an inaccurate reflection on what occurred, but these comments point to a number of ways the process could have been improved. Evaluating an inclusion project has been a learning process too, just as much as actually developing the project itself. Although the evaluator is an experienced worker in the field each type of project highlights new ways of working.

Good aspects:
* the use of data from both providers and attendees
* data collected throughout the programme
* the use of Dan, the programme assistant to collect some of the data
* use of an outside evaluator
* the importance placed on evaluation

Areas where improvements could be made are as follows:
* There needed to be a clearer idea earlier on in the project of the evaluation programme and how it linked in with the represent programme. Appointment of the evaluator even earlier on might have helped here.

* There needed to be clearer communication of the types of evaluation to be used, and when and why. Although an agreed programme was known to all staff this could have been discussed and developed further in the planning stage. This would have helped develop closer links between staff and the evaluator earlier on. Agreement from all providers is necessary so they are clearer about the role and its context.

* There was probably a need for one or more project update meetings. Some were attended and others were done by phone. This project it might prove more useful to hold a full meeting with all staff. This would have improved communication of current events and developments to the evaluator, and of the evaluator needs to the staff. It would be fair to say that initially staff felt uneasy about my task and developing trust and comfort about the process of evaluation took longer than the evaluator expected. More meetings may have helped with this.

* Evaluation should have been started by the evaluator sooner. Although she was appointed towards the beginning of the project her involvement at the start with programme ideas and planning would have been useful. This would have also provided longer to develop a relationship with the team and thus overcome initial
reticence from team members. More time might have been useful to do more formative evaluation.

* Members of the team who felt they had not got time to write diaries needed to agree some form of reporting of their own personal feelings. This would have provided backup information.

Elsewhere a form developed by the evaluator for users to fill in was not used by the staff with the young people. This in itself was fine but there was a failure to collect the data in another way as requested by the evaluator.

* Video diaries would have been more useful if they had included casual conversation within the group before and after the session.

* Further training of appropriate staff would have benefited staff and the evaluation, for example Dan would have benefited from some training (he did some of the data collection for me).

* A slippage in the programme time-scale meant that less had been achieved when the final report for this phase of funding was finished. And thus there was less to report on and evaluate.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>WORK PROGRAMME - EVALUATOR</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Initial project development - meetings and planning of evaluation</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Initial research</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collection of data and administration of</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(phone calls for updates etc)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attendance of meetings and of programme events</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focus Groups</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assessment of data</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>( diaries</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>video diaries</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>photo scrapbooks</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>personal notes from meetings and events</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>focus groups</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>evaluation forms and comments cards</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Final analysis and writing of report</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>including updates</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
REPRESENT
AN EVALUATION

Kate Pontin
Consultant Evaluator